



Maricopa County Sheriff's Office

Paul Penzone, Sheriff

Sheriff Paul Penzone
Maricopa County Sheriff's
Office
550 West Jackson Street
Phoenix, AZ 85003
Phone: (602) 876-1000
www.mcso.org

6/8/2021

The 6th Traffic Stop Annual Report (TSAR) released on June 8, 2021, reflects disparate outcomes in various areas based on race consistent with past traffic studies. As I have said many times, these disparate outcomes identify possible systemic racial bias in our patrol function. Although I am encouraged that the disparity in some of these outcomes has declined in the past year and are relatively small (1% difference or less in search rates for example), the increase in disparities in citation rates is priority of concern.

Since the last TSAR published in May 2020, MCSO has taken additional steps to identify, investigate and monitor these disparities in an effort to reduce and eliminate them. In some areas, given the reduction in disparities, we believe this work has been fruitful. During the past year, MCSO's work includes but is not limited to the following:

- MCSO has published three Traffic Stop Quarterly Reports (TSQR) designed to provide better insight into these disparities and to the effectiveness of MCSO's efforts to eliminate them.
 - TSQR 1 (3rd Quarter 2020) *Supervisor Review* investigated supervisors' review of vehicle stop contact forms and body worn camera footage of deputies under their supervision. The report recommended that MCSO develop and disseminate specific expectations and guidance to supervisors in order to standardize traffic stop review as much as possible. Our proposal for additional supervisor training on this issue is currently pending with the Monitor.
 - TSQR 2 (4th Quarter 2020) *Supervisor Survey of TSAR 3 Interventions* surveyed supervisors who were involved in prior interventions with deputies identified in past traffic reports. This survey resulted in MCSO recommendations for better efficiency and effectiveness for supervisors and deputies which are currently being implemented in the current Traffic Study Monthly Report pilot program.
 - TSQR 3 (March 2021) *Extended Traffic Stop Indicator Use* looked at the accuracy of deputies identifying a stop as extended for various reasons including DUI investigation, language barriers, technical issues, etc. The report found that deputies are appropriately identifying stops as extended but was unable to determine why racial disparities existed in extended traffic stops. The report recommended reinforcing the use of MCSO's language line (Voiance) as well as continuing efforts on recruiting multilingual deputies. The report also identified specific patrol areas where server coverage and connectivity are lacking which has been referred to MCSO's Technology Bureau. The analysis also identified the need for additional Extended Stop Indicators, including identifying if there is an issue with a driver's license, registration or insurance verification and "other" category for deputies to be more specific. MCSO has proposed these changes to the Vehicle Stop Contact Form and they are pending approval from the Monitor. Finally, this report recommended further quarterly reports studying disparities in arrests, which the Monitor recently approved as a topic.
- The stop length for Hispanics showed a 58 second increase in stop length over last year. Stop length, not just extended stops, has been a focus of MCSO since the last TSAR. In addition to the TSQR 3 discussed above, MCSO will have an additional TSQR (TSQR 4) focused on long stops that don't qualify as an "extended stop" published by June 30, 2021. Our hope is that this study will offer additional insight and recommendations to help reduce disparities in this area.
- The Monitor recently approved a TSQR topic to look at the disparities in citation rates. Because of the concerning increase in this area, I have asked the Bureau of Internal Oversight (BIO) to prioritize this report over other report topics that have been approved. I ask the Monitor to work with us to expedite the approval of an appropriate methodology so that we can publish a report by

the end of the year. Some of the other topics in line for quarterly reports include arrests and disparities based on Districts.

- In April, after months of work with the Monitor and parties, MCSO started a pilot program for Traffic Stop Monthly Reports (TSMR). The TSMR reviews and compares deputy traffic stop patterns using a rolling twelve-month period. The intent of this monthly report is to provide early alerts to supervisors of patterns of conduct that may reflect bias and allow for quicker training and response directly to individual deputies.
- We continue to provide extensive training related to constitutional, bias-free policing. In addition to our annual training, during the past year, our Training Division presented a workshop focused on “Everyday Lessons in Privilege and Bias” to Field Training Officers by an outside expert from Arizona State University. Our Training Division also developed a video on “The History and Impact of Discriminatory Policing in Maricopa County.” Additional videos related to implicit bias and cultural competency focused on hearing directly from community members in the areas we serve. Lastly, the Training Division launched a class dedicated to Fair and Impartial Decision-Making and will continue including instruction on this topic in future training offerings. These videos/trainings fall under our Constitutional Policing Plan which was developed to remediate possible systemic racial bias in our patrol function. In addition to the trainings, Deputies also receive semi-annual reminders of our CP-8 Policy, Preventing Racial and Other Bias-Based Profiling, which prohibits bias-based policing, and three roll call briefings each year on topics of implicit bias, fair and impartial decision making, and cultural competency.
- From April 1, 2020 through March 31, 2021, MCSO received 25 complaints, two from traffic stops, alleging bias from the Hispanic community. During that same period, our Professional Standards Bureau closed 17 bias complaint investigations. Of those closed, none were sustained. MCSO currently has 17 open cases alleging bias against the plaintiffs’ class though it should be noted that 6 of these investigations have been complete and are pending the closure process. Since 2017, there have been no sustained findings of bias allegations involving traffic stops. All investigative findings were reviewed by the Monitor and found in compliance with the Court’s Order.
- From April 1, 2020 - March 31, 2021, the Community Outreach Division (COrD) was severely impacted by the Coronavirus Pandemic in its ability to meet with the community. As a result, the COrD used virtual meetings and presentations made available by community partners. The COrD attended 20 events focused on the Latino community, including work at Franklin Police and Fire High School, which provides vocational training to high school students in law enforcement studies. Members of the COrD taught lessons on criminal law, civil rights, detention, and drug education, among others. COrD also assisted in establishing a MCSO youth cadet post at the high school. COrD continued its work at the Guadalupe Boxing Gym, with support of youth through mentorship, as well as offering presentations of drug education and awareness to elementary schools in the Town of Gila Bend and the community of Aguila.

I am encouraged by some of the findings in the 6th TSAR, but I am certainly not complacent. There is still considerable work to be done. We will continue to work with the Monitor, the parties, and the community on methods to mitigate the disparate outcomes in our patrol function, as well as root out racial bias, where it exists. I remain committed to ethical, constitutional policing practices at the Maricopa County Sheriff’s Office.

Sheriff Paul Penzone
Maricopa County Sheriff’s Office